

Environmental impact of feed additives in cattle production

Ermias Kebreab, PhD

University of California-Davis, Davis, CA 95616

Abstract

Cattle production is one of the main contributors to methane emissions globally. Although there are nutritional, genetic and other methods to reduce methane emissions from cattle operations, feed additives have the potential to substantially decrease emissions. These can be broadly categorized based on their mode of action into 2 main groups. Feed additives can either directly inhibit methanogens that are responsible for methanogenesis or modify the rumen environment to reduce the amount of methane produced. In general, inhibitors such as 3-nitrooxypropanol and macroalgae reduce emissions by 30 to 80%. Feed additives that work indirectly generally reduce emissions by less than 25%. However, a combination of the 2 types may increase the level of anti-methanogenic effectiveness. Some of the most effective feed additives are expected to be available commercially in 2022-2023 in some parts of the world contributing to methane mitigation efforts.

Key words: methane, feed additives, mitigation, climate change

Introduction

Increased attention on methane emissions from ruminants has increased research in its mitigation. Although there are a number of proposed solutions, research on feed additives that have the potential to reduce enteric methane emissions has increased substantially. Anti-methanogenic feed additives can either directly affect methanogenesis in the reticulorumen or indirectly by modifying the rumen environment. Methane inhibitors target methanogens or other microbes associated with methane emissions. Indirect methods include providing the rumen with alternative hydrogen sinks or modify the rumen environment such that hydrogen production, hence, methanogenesis is reduced.

Feed additives directly targeting methanogens

3-Nitrooxypropanol (3NOP)

3NOP is a small molecule with similar shape similar to that of methyl-coenzyme M, which is a substrate of coenzyme M reductase (MCR), the enzyme involved in the last step of methanogenesis.¹ MCR catalyzes the methane-forming step in the rumen fermentation. 3NOP preferably binds into the active site of MCR and effectively inactivates it. 3NOP is demonstrated to inhibit growth of methanogenic archaea at concentrations that do not affect the growth of nonmethanogenic bacteria in the rumen.¹ Several studies using 3NOP as an additive have reported reduction in methane emissions from beef and dairy cattle up to 60%. A meta-analysis² estimated the effectiveness of 3NOP to be an average of 32.5% reduction, however, 3-NOP dose and diet composition affected the level of methane mitigation achievable. Supplementation of 3NOP did not significantly affect feed intake or milk production.³ 3NOP is now approved for use in the European Union, Brazil and Chile among other countries. It is still awaiting registration in the U.S. and Canada.

Macroalgae

Some seaweed species, particularly *Asparagopsis* spp., contain bromoform and bromochloromethane as active ingredients that has been shown to be effective in vitro.⁴ In vivo trial using *Asparagopsis* spp. in dairy cattle reported up to 67% reduction in methane production in dairy cattle.^{5,6} Methane emissions in Brangus cattle declined 98% with inclusion of only 0.02% (on organic matter basis) of *Asparagopsis taxiformis*.⁷ A longer-term study reported no evidence of microbial adaptation, however, the anti-methanogenic efficacy was dependent on fiber concentration.⁸ The efficacy of methane reduction appears to correlate with the concentration of bromoform compounds, which appear to be the main active ingredients although other yet-to-be identified substances may contribute to methane reduction as well.⁹ A formulation containing *Asparagopsis taxiformis* (Brominata[®]) is now approved for use and sale in California. However, it will need to be approved by Food and Drug Administration to claim methane mitigation in the U.S.

Feed additives that affect methanogenesis indirectly

Nitrate

Nitrate (NO₃⁻) is a strong inorganic anion and as a feed additive, acts as an alternative hydrogen sink in the rumen competing with methanogens for hydrogen utilization thereby reducing methane emission. Based on the stoichiometry for hydrogen consumption within the rumen, nitrate has a theoretical capability of reducing ruminal CH₄ production 25.8 g/100 g of nitrate supplemented.¹⁰ A meta-analysis that used only in vivo experiments indicated that nitrate supplementation reduced methane emission in dairy and beef cattle by an average of 13.9% in a dose-dependent manner.¹¹ The mitigating effect of nitrate on methane production and yield was greater in dairy than in beef cattle. However, effect of type of cattle appears to be related to slow-release nitrate use in beef cattle. Although an effective strategy, it is not recommended in commercial setting because feeding nitrate has the risk of nitrite toxicity resulting in methemoglobinemia. Furthermore, if nitrate is supplemented to a protein-sufficient diet, the extra nitrogen will be excreted and increase nitrous oxide emissions to the atmosphere and contaminate ground water with ammonia. Nitrate does not benefit animal productivity unless added to a protein-deficient diet.¹²

Tannins

Tannins are soluble, phenolic compounds that accumulate within plant tissues likely due to ongoing metabolic processes and contribute to the plant defense system.¹³ Tannins have affinity to bind to proteins and other compounds. They are classified as either condensed or hydrolysable, and both types of tannins have been shown to exert anti-methanogenic effects by directly inhibiting some methanogens and indirectly by decreasing protozoa population associated with methanogens. This decreases hydrogen production through inhibition of

fibrolytic bacteria and fiber digestibility, and act as an alternative hydrogen sink to methanogenesis.¹⁴ A meta-analysis¹⁵ showed that low levels of inclusions of tannins in animal diets often yielded inconsistent results on methane production, but that variability seemed to diminish at higher doses. They estimated a linear decrease in methane emission per unit of feed intake of 3.65% with each 10 g/kg DM addition. However, reduction in methane production was often followed by a suppression in organic matter and fiber digestibility. Care should be taken when supplementing tannins as several studies have shown that tannins bind and interact with dietary proteins in the gastrointestinal tract, which reduces nitrogen availability to the animal.¹⁶

Essential oils and blends

Essential oils are naturally occurring chemical compounds extracted from plants and used in fragrances and cosmetics and, to a lesser extent, pharmaceutical products for humans and animals.¹⁷ Consumption of essential oils affects rumen microbial communities and fermentation patterns in a varying manner, depending on the source.¹⁸ Many essential oils hold a high affinity for lipid and bacterial membranes, leading to disruption, but the broad antimicrobial effect is likely to be due to a combination of mechanisms.¹⁹ Numerous plants such as cinnamon, lemongrass, ginger, garlic, juniper berries, eucalyptus, thyme, citrus, oregano, mint, rosemary and coriander have been screened in vitro.^{20,21} However, only few have been studied in vivo. Some studies have used an essential oil “blend” or “complex” containing extracts from multiple plants. For example, Mootral, synthesized from natural products including garlic- and flavonoid-containing citrus extract, reduced methane emissions by 23% after 12-week supplementation at 1.58 g/kg DM.²²

References

1. Duin EC, Wagner T, Shima S, Prakash D, Cronin B, Yanez-Ruiz DR, Duval S, Rumbeli R, Stemmler RT, Thauer RK, Kindermann M. Mode of action uncovered for the specific reduction of methane emissions from ruminants by the small molecule 3-nitrooxypropanol. *Proc Natl Acad Sci*. 2016;113:6172e6177.
2. Dijkstra J, Bannink A, France J, Kebreab E, van Gastelen S. Short communication: Antimethanogenic effects of 3-nitrooxypropanol depend on supplementation dose, dietary fiber content, and cattle type. *J Dairy Sci* 2018;101:9041-9047.
3. Hristov AN, Oh J, Giallongo F, Frederick TW, Harper MT, Weeks HL, Branco AF, Moate PJ, Deighton MH, Williams SRO, Kindermann M, Duval S. An inhibitor persistently decreased enteric methane emission from dairy cows with no negative effect on milk production. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 2015;112:10663-10668.
4. Machado L, Magnusson M, Paul NA, Kinley RD, de Nys R, Tomkins N. Identification of bioactives from the red seaweed *Asparagopsis taxiformis* that promote antimethanogenic activity in vitro. *J Appl Phycol* 2016;28:3117e3126.
5. Roque BM, Salwen JK, Kinley R, Kebreab E. Inclusion of *Asparagopsis armata* in lactating dairy cows' diet reduces enteric methane emission by over 50 percent. *J Cleaner Prod* 2019;234:132-138.
6. Stefanoni HA, Räisänen SE, Cueva SF, Wasson DE, Lage CFA, Melgar A, Fetter ME, Smith P, Hennessy M, Vecchiarelli B, Bender J, Pitta D, Cantrell CL, Yarish C, Hristov AN. Effects of the macroalga *Asparagopsis taxiformis* and oregano leaves on methane emission, rumen fermentation, and lactational performance of dairy cows. *J Dairy Sci* 2021;104:4157-4173.
7. Kinley RD, Martinez-Fernandez G, Matthews MK, de Nys R, Magnusson M, Tomkins NW. Mitigating the carbon footprint and improving productivity of ruminant livestock agriculture using a red seaweed. *J Cleaner Prod* 2020;59:120836.
8. Roque BM, Venegas M, Kinley R, deNys R, Duarte TL, Yang X, Kebreab E. Red seaweed (*Asparagopsis taxiformis*) supplementation reduces enteric methane by over 80 percent in beef steers. *PLoS ONE* 2021; 16:e0247820.
9. Vijn S, Compart DP, Dutta N, Foukis A, Hess M, Hristov A, Kalscheur KF, Kebreab E, Nuzhdin SV, Price NN, Sun Y, Tricarico JM, Turzillo A, Weisbjerg MR, Yarish C, Kurt T. Key considerations for the use of seaweed to reduce enteric methane emissions from cattle. *Front Vet Sci* 2020;7:597430.
10. van Zijderveld SM, Gerrits WJJ, Apajalahti JA, Newbold JR, Dijkstra J, Leng RA, Perdok HB. Nitrate and sulfate: Effective alternative hydrogen sinks for mitigation of ruminal methane production in sheep. *J Dairy Sci* 2010;93:5856-5866.
11. Feng XY, Dijkstra J, Bannink A, van Gastelen S, France J, Kebreab E. Anti-methanogenic effects of nitrate supplementation in cattle: A meta-analysis. *J Dairy Sci* 2020;103:11375-11385.
12. Yang C, Rooke JA, Cabeza I, Wallace RJ. Nitrate and inhibition of ruminal methanogenesis: microbial ecology, obstacles, and opportunities for lowering methane emissions from ruminant livestock. *Front Microbiol* 2016;7:132.
13. Swanson BG. Tannins and polyphenols. Pages 5729-5733 in *Encyclopedia of Food Sciences and Nutrition*. Eds Caballero B, Trugo LC, Finglas PM. 2003. Academic Press: London, UK.
14. Aboagye IA, Beauchemin KA. Potential of molecular weight and structure of tannins to reduce methane emissions from ruminants: a review. *Animals* 2019;9:856.
15. Jayanegara A, Leiber F, Kreuzer M. Meta-analysis of the relationship between dietary tannin level and methane formation in ruminants from in vivo and in vitro experiments. *J Anim Physiol Anim Nutr* 2012;96:365-375.
16. Waghorn G. Beneficial and detrimental effects of dietary condensed tannins for sustainable sheep and goat production—Progress and challenges. *Anim Feed Sci Technol* 2008;147:116-139.
17. Honan M, Feng X, Tricarico JM, Kebreab E. Feed additives as a strategic approach to reduce enteric methane production in cattle: modes of action, effectiveness and safety. *Anim Prod Sci* 2022, in press.
18. Benchaar C, Greathead H. Essential oils and opportunities to mitigate enteric methane emissions from ruminants. *Anim Feed Sci Technol* 2011;166:338-355.
19. Helander IM, Alakomi HL, Latva-Kala K, Mattila-Sandholm T, Pol I, Smid EJ, Gorris LG, von Wright A. Characterization of the action of selected essential oil components on Gram-negative bacteria. *J Agric Food Chem* 1998;46:3590-3595.
20. Benchaar C, Calsamiglia S, Chaves AV, Fraser GR, Colombato D, McAllister TA, Beauchemin KA. A review of plant-derived essential oils in ruminant nutrition and production. *Anim Feed Sci Technol* 2008;145:209-228.
21. Nanon A, Suksombat W, Wen ZY. Use of essential oils for manipulation of rumen microbial fermentation using batch culture. *Wetenschap Sattawaphaet* 2015;45:167-180.
22. Roque B, van Lingen H, Vrancken H, Kebreab E. Effect of Mootral – a garlic- and citrus-extract-based feed additive – on enteric methane emissions in feedlot cattle. *Transl Anim Sci* 2019;3:1383-1388.

